

PlanZone@annapolis.gov • 410-263-7961 • Fax 410-263-1129 • TDD use MD Relay or 711 • www.annapolis.gov

#### **Historic Preservation Commission**

July 9, 2013

The Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) of the City of Annapolis held its regularly scheduled public meeting on July 9, 2013 in the City Council Chambers. **Chair** Kennedy called the meeting to order at 7:34p.m.

Commissioners Present: Chair Kennedy, Vice Chair Leahy, Zeno, Kabriel, Toews

**Commissioners Absent:** Finch, Jones

Staff Present: Craig-Historic Preservation Officer

**Chair** Kennedy introduced the commissioners and staff. She stated the Commission's purpose pursuant to the Authority of Article 66B, Section 8.01-8.17 of the Annotated Code of Maryland and administered the oath en mass to all persons intending to testify at the hearing.

#### C. ANNOUCEMENTS

Ms. Craig reminded the HPC that the preservation summer school is scheduled for July 24, 2013 at St. John's College. The focus of the summer school is communication and preservation stories and will also include updates on the Preserve Maryland Plan. She encouraged members to register to attend and since this is training it could be covered under the CLG training grant. Lastly, the scavenger hunt will be included in the presentation as part of the concluding events.

## D. VIOLATIONS

There were no violations reported.

## E. CONSENT DOCKET

1. 144 Conduit Street – First Presbyterian Church of Annapolis – Construct new Columbarium addition at rear of building. Installation of a bench and new brick pavers to match the existing brick walk. Approved as submitted.

**Vice Chair** Leahy moved to approve 144 Conduit Street on the consent docket. Ms. Zeno seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously in a vote of 5-0.

### F. OLD BUSINESS

1. 160 Duke of Gloucester Street/Noah Hillman Garage – Donald D. Smith/Smith Architects – Detailed design of emergency generator foundation. (Continuation)

**Chair** Kennedy clarified that the HPC approved the generator associated with this application but requested additional information on the walkway and the screening.

Mr. Smith referred to the new generator specifications indicating that the manufacturer was changed and that the color of the generator has changed to green. He provided two sets of plans and discussed what each entails. SP1 is the site plan that shows the demolition plan, existing conditions and new construction including the landscaping. Using plan SP2, he described the total height of the generator enclosure as 8.5-feet above the concrete pad. The pad is needed to accommodate the weight of the generator that is 8,500lbs with an allowance for the fuel. The foundation was calculated at a weight of 150lbs per cubic foot. The pad is 12-inches thick and was inspected by a geotechnical engineer. This plan further shows the detail of the cross section through the walkway where concrete has been turned up to form a curb. Mr. Kabriel asked whether there are additional studies on the noise level generated by the generator when it is running. Mr. Smith referred him to the manufacturer sound ratings in the specification. Mr. Clinton Pratt added that the best sound liner/muffler available for the unit has been provided but anticipates the sound ratings to be under the legal requirement of the State approximately 75 decibels max.

**Staff:** Ms. Craig supports the change in generator color and has no additional comments other than requesting clarification on the location of the concrete wall or curb to which Mr. Smith responded. After the clarification, she agreed with the proposed use of the curbing design and the need to the increase it to 18".

**Public:** Public testimony opened at 8:01pm and no one from the public spoke in favor or opposition of the application so **Chair** Kennedy declared the public testimony closed at 8:02pm.

**Commissioners:** The Commission asked that the applicant several clarifying questions to which he responded.

**Vice Chair** Leahy moved to amend the previously approved application for 160 Duke of Gloucester Street to incorporate the details for the plant landscaping, paving and retaining wall design as well as the change in the generator color. Ms. Zeno seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously in a vote of 5-0.

**Chair** Kennedy accepted the following exhibits into the record.

Exhibit	
Number	Exhibit Types
F	Email from Cynthia Gudenius and corresponding documentation from applicant
G	Smith Architect plans dated 2/20/13
Н	Diesel Generator Set QSB7 Series Engine Specification

- 2. 11 S. Acton Place T. Averill Architects LLC Construct new 2 ½ story addition and in-ground pool (WITHDRAWN)
- H. NEW BUSINESS
- 2. <u>16 Southgate Avenue</u> Gary Schwerzler/Fourth Street Design Studio, Inc. Demolition and infill of existing exterior doors, windows and partial walls. Install new windows, doors and skylights. Install new landscaping, fencing, screen wall on front elevation, garage door and sliding door from garage to courtyard entry. Replace roof.

Mr. Schwerzler explained that the rehabilitation objective is to transform the neglected structure at 16 Southgate Avenue into a livable structure. He went over the issues to be addressed to include entry into the property; access to the garden from the house; modifications to the exterior walls; and installing doors on the garage. He discussed the design concepts to include replacing the existing doors; relocating the door and masonry steps; removing the exterior doors and windows to address floor plan changes; and installing a new garage door to match the existing exterior colors. Plan 1A shows the removal of a section of the wall to create a new entry and Plan 1B show the swapping of a window for a door and relocation of the entrance to the garden. A wall will be modified in the bedroom to swap out an existing window for a door to gain access to the garden from this location. On Plan 1C filled in an existing door to create a functioning kitchen and the bathroom window has been closed on the rear elevation to accommodate the new shower.

**Staff:** Ms. Craig explained that the original comments indicated an uncertainty of whether the house was contributing but research using the Sandborn (1930-1959) indicates that there are elements that are noncontributing to the building including the two small additions. **Chair** Kennedy said that the HPC will be requesting a window by window analysis of what is in the contributing and noncontributing sections to identify how many of the historic windows are being lost by this proposal. Ms. Craig noted that this will be addressed in the next iteration. She pointed out some of the key items in the staff recommendation that relate to the contributing building and the applicable criteria. She briefly identified some of the modifications to be included in the next iteration. She believes that the next iteration of the proposal will significantly be in compliance to the guidelines. **Public:** Public testimony opened at 8:29pm and those speaking are listed below.

NameAddressIn FavorIn OppositionDonna WareHA, Inc.X

No one else from the public spoke in favor or opposition of the application so **Chair** Kennedy declared the public testimony closed at 8:30pm.

**Commissioners:** The HPC asked several questions to which the applicant responded.

The following Commissioners made a site visit on this application.

Name
Kennedy, Leahy, Toews, Zeno, Kabriel

Exhibit Number	Exhibit Types
Α	Application date time stamped 6/13/13, 10:34am
В	Staff Memorandum dated 7/5/13
С	Historic Annapolis Foundation Inc. Letter dated 7/9/13
D	Fourth Street Design Studio, Inc. Document dated 7/9/13
E	Sandborn Map undated (Covering 1930 – 1959)

**Chair** Kennedy went over items that the applicant should address at the next preapplication. These include:

- a.) Reordering the skylights to be located on the rear façade instead of the front façade to comply with Guideline D.12;
- b.) 6-feet front courtyard gate appears to be over scale or provide a contextual view of where the structure currently sits;
- c.) The applicant should take a second look at fence types to ensure that it complies with C.6
- d.) Provide a window by window analysis of what is contributing and noncontributing;
- e.) Removal of the glass block of the plan;
- f.) Provide cut sheets for all components of the project.
- g.) Address DNEP comments regarding the egress on the east bedroom window;
- h.) HVAC location and screening plans needs to be identified on the site plans
- i.) Exterior light fixtures detail (Mr. Schwerzler noted that no exterior lighting has been selected for plan)

Mr. Schwerzler waived the 45-day rule on condition that the application is placed on the July 25, 2013 agenda. **Chair** Kennedy informed Mr. Schwerzler that in order to accommodate the request, materials must be submitted by July 19, 2013. The application is continued to the July 25, 2013.

**3. 207 & 209 Duke of Gloucester Street** - Gary Schwerzler/Fourth Street Design Studio, Inc. – Construct new covers over existing porches and relocate light fixture.

Mr. Schwerzler noted that the building has had a lot of work over the years. The last iteration is identified on Sheet E1 of the plan and the photographs show the existing conditions. He explained that the original house included covers over the doors but there were poorly designed so were removed. The owners would like to reinstall the covers for protection from the rain. He noted that drawing A2 shows the shape of the building from the side and the porch covers are constructed to include a catch on the design. The light fixtures will need to be relocated in order to keep the scale of the porch covers.

**Staff:** Ms. Craig restated her written comments and recommend conditional approval subject to the applicant ensuring that the metal porch hoods be fabricated to match the existing inset metal dormer roof.

**Public:** Public testimony opened at 9:06pm and those speaking are listed below.

Name	Address	In Favor	In Opposition
Donna Ware	HA, Inc.	X	

No one else from the public spoke in favor or opposition of the application so **Chair** Kennedy declared the public testimony closed at 9:07pm.

**Commissioners:** The Commission asked the applicant several clarifying questions relating to specific components of the project to which he responded.

**Vice Chair** Leahy noted that whereas the application for 207-209 Duke of Gloucester complies with SOI 9 and 10, guidelines B.8. D.10a, D.24, D.28b, D.30, moved approval subject to the applicant fabricating the metal porch hood to match the existing inset metal dormer roof. Ms. Zeno seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously in a vote of 4-1. (Kennedy dissents)

The following Commissioners made a site visit on this application.

Name	
Kennedy, Leahy, Toews, Zeno, Kabriel	

**Chair** Kennedy accepted the following exhibits into the record.

Exhibit Number	Exhibit Types
Α	Application date time stamped 6/13/13 10:39am
В	Staff Memorandum dated 7/5/13
С	HA Inc. Comments dated 7/9/13

- <u>4.</u> <u>37 Cornhill Street</u> Bryan Braley & Stacey Turner Install new porch, fencing with gates, tree removal, landscaping, window replacement and restoration of front stoop and door. (WITHDRAWN)
- <u>5.</u> <u>79 Franklin Street</u> Julia Shiller Remove rear porch and reconstruct. Replace existing rear door and window and install French door with sidelights.

Augusta Tono, Architect, explained that there is an existing porch on the rear elevation that some elements are not of the period and were added at a later date. The intent of the project is to capture some of the afternoon light into the rear space. He explained that even though the property is for commercial and residential use, the owners will be using the property as a residence only. The proposal will try to solve the issue of the block wall by enlarging the existing porch and allowing a French door to be placed in the rear to include a side light.

**Staff:** Ms. Craig restated her written comments and recommend approval of the application as amended.

**Public:** Public testimony opened at 9:38pm and those speaking are listed below.

Name	Address	In Favor	In Opposition
Donna Ware	HA, Inc.		X

No one else from the public spoke in favor or opposition of the application so **Chair** Kennedy declared the public testimony closed at 9:40pm.

**Commissioners:** The Commission went over the list of issues to be addressed to include the door and roof replacement to be approved administratively by staff. The siding, columns, windows, gutters, downspouts will be removed from the application and consideration. There is not sufficient detail for the railings, columns and stairs. A majority of the commissioners present believe that there is not sufficient enough information to vote on the application so agreed that an continuation was necessary. The applicant was asked to provide a clear set of plans that remove the items noted above. The applicant was asked to provide revised plans for the back porch with door, revised roof plan, details on columns, railing, floor, and foundation changes. The applicant waived the 45-day rule and the application was continued to the July 25, 2013 meeting.

The following Commissioners made a site visit on this application.

Name	
Kennedy, Leahy, Toews, Zeno, Kabriel	

**Chair** Kennedy accepted the following exhibits into the record.

Exhibit Number	Exhibit Types
Α	Application date time stamped 7/133, 2013 10:41am
В	Staff Memorandum dated July 5, 2013
С	HA, Inc. Comments dated 7/9/13
D	Reinhart letter dated 7/5/13

#### H. ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

# 1. Adoption of Findings for 82 Conduit Street

**Vice Chair** Leahy moved to accept the amended findings for 82 Conduit Street into the record. Ms. Zeno seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously in a vote of 5-0.

# 2. Adoption of Comments to City Council Relating to O-7-13

The HPC recessed at 10:06pm and reconvened at 10:10pm.

The HPC deliberated and discussed the O-7-13 comment letter to the Council drafted by **Chair** Kennedy. The HPC agreed that there were some edits needed to the letter. **Chair** Kennedy will make the edits and prepare the document for a email vote.

### I. ADJOURNMENT

With there being no further business, **Ms. Zeno** moved to adjourn the meeting at 10:30pm. Mr. Kabriel seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously in a vote of 5-0.

The next meeting is scheduled for July 25, 2013 at 6:30pm at the Pip Moyer Recreation Center

Tami Hook, Recorder